



November 17, 2021
Historic Architectural Review Board Minutes
Troxell Council Chambers
Borough of Gettysburg

Chair Gary Shaffer called the Historical Architectural Review Board Meeting to order at 7:03 PM on Wednesday, November 17, 2021 in Troxell Council Chambers, 59 E. High Street. A quorum of six (6) Board Members was present. Those in attendance were **Board Members:** Chair Gary Shaffer, Vice-Chair Brandon Stone, Joan Hodges, Jim McCabe, Suzanne Christianson, Gettysburg Building Code Official Clem Malot of PA Municipal Code Alliance, Director of Historic and Environmental Preservation Debra English, and Planning Management Assistant Karen Mesher; **Absent Board Member:** Justin Harman; **Others in Attendance:** Ross Hetrick, President of the Thaddeus Stevens Society, representing the erection of the Thaddeus Stevens Statue in front of 111 Baltimore Street-Historic Adams County Courthouse; and Property/Business Owners Tony, Jane and Julie Strickland, Architect Joe Edgar of Snyder's Residential Design LLC, and Architect Gary Shaffer of Shaffer Design Associates PC; all representing 531 Baltimore Street.

Call Meeting to Order

Chair Gary Shaffer called the meeting to order at 7:03 PM in Troxell Council Chambers and conducted a roll call of members in attendance and confirmed a quorum of six voting members present.

Introductions and HARB Review Procedures

Chair Shaffer introduced the Board members and explained the procedures that would be followed during the meeting. He explained that only the Board members that were present at that meeting can vote on agenda topics and minutes. He noted that the Board serves as a recommending body to Borough Council, which makes the final decision concerning the issuance of Certificates of Appropriateness. He said that ***"HARB is a design review board only; and that each project must meet all other Borough ordinances and building code requirements prior to final approval through Borough Council."*** Borough Council will next meet on Monday, December 13, 2021.

Review of Agenda and Minutes

Chair Shaffer asked the Board to accept the November 17, 2021 HARB Meeting Agenda as presented. Ms. Hodges made a **motion** to accept the November 17, 2021 HARB Meeting Agenda as presented. The motion was seconded by Ms. Christianson and carried 6-to-0 without dissent.

Chair Shaffer asked the Board to review and accept the October 20, 2021 HARB Meeting Minutes as submitted. Ms. Christianson made a **motion** to accept the October 20, 2021 HARB Meeting Minutes as submitted. The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges and carried 6-to-0 without dissent.

Public Comment for Items Not on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items not on the meeting agenda.

Public Comment for Items on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items on the meeting agenda.

New Business: Applications for Review

A. COA-21-0140 MINOR PROJECT: 111 Baltimore Street, Historic Adams County Courthouse – Ross Hetrick, President of the Thaddeus Stevens Society

Erect a Thaddeus Stevens Statue in the sidewalk area to encompass 36.7 sf. This footer will support a 6-foot-tall statue weighing 550 lbs. The support concrete will be 1.5' thick with re-enforced rods and will be 30" x 24" in diameter. The existing spotlight will remain for use. The statue will be placed in the sidewalk planter area which will be filled with concrete.

Director English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her November 17, 2021 HARB Meeting Agenda. She said that the Historic Adams County Courthouse first appeared on the Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps in 1886 as a two-story brick structure with a slate or tin roof, and a frame clock tower.

Mr. Hetrick, President of the Thaddeus Stevens Society, gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Mr. Hetrick said that the Thaddeus Stevens Society plans to erect the second statue to ever be placed anywhere in front of the Historic Adams County Courthouse (and the first was placed at the Thaddeus Stevens College in Lancaster PA). He said that their contractor, Young Masonry, has recommended that the 24" with reinforcement rods around the edges in order to support the 550 lb. statue, and that the spot light in the space will remain. He said that the work will be done after the appropriate permits have been issued and weather allows and may be as early as late November. He said that the statue will be put into place in late March 2022 by W.J. Strickler Signs with a boom crane truck. He said that the statue has a base of 30 inches by 24 inches and is 1.5 inches thick and will be fastened to the concrete pad with bolts that are on inch thick and 10 inches long and will go into holes that are two inches from the four corners of the base. He said that work will be done by Inferno Art Foundry of Union City Georgia. He said that one or two wayside signs may be installed adjacent to the statue, but they have not been designed yet with applications for their installation submitted at a later date. He said that Borough Highway Occupancy Permits (HOPs) for the concrete and crane work will be submitted closer to when the work will be performed and noted that PA One Call will be notified closer to the concrete work. He said that Thaddeus Stevens had played a pivotal role in Gettysburg where he was a successful lawyer and involved in municipal affairs, was elected to the PA House of Representatives before his election to the US House of Representatives where he was instrumental in the passage of the 13 Amendment abolishing slavery, and later moved his practice and home to Lancaster PA where he was a strong advocate for free education and commitment to equality and civil rights. Mr. Hetrick noted that the bronze statue will have a base depicting a map of his travels in Pennsylvania showing York, Lancaster, Harrisburg, Gettysburg, and Caledonia.

Chair Shaffer presented *The Proposed Findings of Fact* for the Minor Project for the bronze Thaddeus Stevens Statue in front of the Historic Adams County Courthouse at 11 Baltimore Street. He said that

statuary has been previously reviewed by HARB and that the Board will review scale, materials used, impact on the public way, and the appropriateness of the structure in a highly visible corner of Baltimore and Washington Streets. He said that the statue is depicting a prominent figure, is located in the Historic District, and that the new installation of the statue is of high importance to the Borough of Gettysburg, and thus falls under the review right of the Board and is consistent with both the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide*.

Ms. Hodges made a **motion** to recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of the historical statue of Thaddeus Stevens in front of the Historic Adams County Courthouse at 111 Baltimore Street as presented in the application dated October 25, with a project scope that is consistent with both the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide*. The motion was seconded by Mr. McCabe and carried **6-to-0 without dissention**.

Director English reminded the applicant that a UCC permit application will be needed for the foundation of the statue.

(Mr. Shaffer recused himself due to a fiduciary relationship with the following applicant, whereby Mr. Stone assumed the role as Chair.)

B. COA 21-0142 MAJOR PROJECT – 531 Baltimore Street – David and Susan Strickland

Using design details of the original shingle style building with Queen Anne details including shingle/shake replication siding, windows with multiple rectangular diamond mullion divisions, and featuring a window in the gabled front projecting wing/extension with the intent to create a design that simulates a residential building converted to a commercial/retail use. Council approved demolition on March 8, 2021.

Director English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her November 17, 2021 HARB Meeting Agenda. She said that the structure first appeared on the Sanborne Fire Insurance Maps in 1907 as a two-story frame dwelling with a singled roof. The permit history for the property includes: Z18-0002 for a Special Exception for “Outdoor commercial recreated entertainment activity” use in the TC Zoning District per Section 27-930B and was granted; Borough Amusement Licenses were granted in 2018, 2019, and 2021; a Sign Permit was issued on May 21, 2018; and the current Demolition Permit involving LU-210018 and COA-210014.

Architect Gary Shaffer from Shaffer Design Associates PC, Architect Joe Edgar from Snyder’s Residential Design LLC and Property Owners Jane, Tony, and Julie Strickland all gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Mr. Shaffer said that design development drawings were provided for HARB review of the architectural style and details of the proposed new structure with the intent to create an infill building that looks like and simulates a residential building converted to a commercial retail use. He said that selected materials would be used to reflect the design details of the original shingle-style building with Queen Anne details including shingle shake replication siding, windows with multiple rectangular diamond division mullions, and will feature the window in the gabled front projecting wing/extension. Mr. Edgar said that the intent is to pick-up traits of the neighborhood and incorporate those elements into the new building that was destroyed by a fire as the result of a vehicle accident. He said that more store front glass would be added to the first floor which will serve as retail and office space; and that the rear of the building will serve as a warehouse.

Ms. Julie Strickland told the Board that this is the third time since the family has owned the building during the last 41 years that it had been hit by a vehicle causing damage, and that they plan to place planters with bollards to protect the building from further strikes. Mr. Shaffer said that the L-shaped front façade with angled porch would be maintained, and that split-shake shingles would be used (metal roof in front and rubber roof in the rear), would have a siding/glass façade, and that the building would be ADA accessible.

Vice-Chair Stone presented *The Proposed Findings of Fact* for the Major Project at 531 Baltimore Street. He said that this would be a new construction project simulating the scope, scale, and design styles that would fit in with neighboring buildings, is located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District and is visible from the public view way via both Baltimore Street and Steinwehr Avenue and thus comes under the review right of this Board. He said that the proposed design is critical and would create an infill building that simulates a residential building that would be converted into a commercial retail use that is consistent with both the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide* for new construction that would be compatible with neighboring buildings in size and scale. He noted that the design styles would use select materials that would reflect the design details of the original shingle-style building.

Ms. Christianson made a **motion** to recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the new construction project at 531 Baltimore Street as presented to the Board in the design development drawings that represent the architectural style and details that is consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide* for new construction as presented to the Board in the application dated October 27, 2021. The motion was second by Mr. Malot and carried **5-to-0 with 1 abstention**.

(Mr. Shaffer resumed his role as Chair.)

Reports

A. Consent Agenda Requiring Board Administrative Approval Since the Last Meeting:

- **COA 21-0130 MINOR PROJECT: 143 W. High Street – Shirley Sistrunk**
Installation of shingle-to-shingle asphalt roof, and all applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* for Historic Restoration.
- **COA 21-0131 MINOR PROJECT: 441 W. Middle Street – Richard Shower**
Installation of shingle-to-shingle roof placement in charcoal black, and all applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* for Historic Restoration.
- **COA 21-0133 MINOR PROJECT: 6 York Street – Gettysburg Hotel Investors**
Installation of 22" x 36" portable A-Frame sign in black metal frame with changeable copy for Starbucks, and all applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* for Restoration.
- **COA 21-0134 MINOR PROJECT: 247 Baltimore Street – Heit Holdings**
Change of occupancy to "Natures Touch" retail use. Installation of the following signs: a 3' x 2' (6 sf) wood and vinyl wall sign, a 2' x 1' (2sf) hanging wood sign, and one 2' x 4' (8sf) plastic portable A-Frame sign to include lettering "Natures Touch | Norse and Wican Inspired Treasures, Holistic

Services and Workshops | Witch Tested, Viking Approved”; and all construction must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* for Historic Restoration.

- **COA 21-0135 MINOR PROJECT: 150 York Street – Thomas and Penelope McKenney**
Installation of an in-kind roof with GAF Timberline HDZ architectural shingles in charcoal color; and all applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* for Historic Restoration.
- **COA 21-0136 MINOR PROJECT: 119 E. Middle Street - Edward and Penelope Ziegler**
Removal of existing wood stockage fence and replace in-kind in same location with a new 6'-high cedar wood privacy fence of 163 linear feet with concave tops and walk gate enclosing the yard; and all applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* for Historic Restoration.
- **COA 21-0137 MINOR PROJECT: 70 E. Water Street – Richard Yetsko Jr.**
Installation of 50 linear square feet of wooden privacy fence from rear porch to rear property line to enclose back yard which is not visible from E. Water Street; and all applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* for Historic Restoration.
- **COA 21-0138 MINOR PROJECT: 58 Chambersburg Street – Ernest Kranias**
Replacement/Painting of in-kind rotted crown molding that will be cut from mahogany stock and configured as original, and capping length of first floor store front wall (Previously approved LU-19-0208 Scope in application dated August 6, 2019); and all applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* for Historic Restoration.
- **COA 21- 0139 MINOR PROJECT: 340 S. Washington Street – Dale and Dorothy Piper**
Installation of an in-kind residential re-roof with GAF Timberline HDZ Charcoal asphalt shingles, and repair fascia; and all applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* for Historic Restoration.
- **COA 21-0102 MINOR PROJECT: 60 E. Middle Street – Bradley Reaver**
Removal of deteriorating, non-functioning chimney (NOV) and reconstruct the brick chimney from the existing brick base below the enclosed roof top which will be cut to rebuild in the same shape and size of the original chimney in 12 tiers of brick, and the non-functional chimney capped (HARB denied the removal of the chimney on 10/20/2021 and requested a re-build); and all applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* for Historic Restoration.

NOTE: HARB is a *design review board only*, each project must meet all other Borough Ordinances and Building code requirements.

The Board discussed COA-21-0141, 110 Chambersburg Street-Philip Schindel, for the installation of an exterior ADA pre-manufactured lift to the second floor roof top decking in order to access a rear third-story apartment entrance; and had decided to remove the item for consideration pending the submission of deck railing pictures by the applicant.

Mr. McCabe made the **motion** for the Board to administratively approve the revised Certificates of Appropriateness (COAs) since the October 20, 2021 HARB Business Meeting with the exception of COA-21-141, 110 Chambersburg Street – Philip Schindel. The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges and carried **6-to-0**.

B. Report of Chair – *Chair Shaffer*

Chair Shaffer gave no report but encouraged the Board to watch training seminars at home to satisfy SHIPO Board Training Credits. Director English told the Board to let her know if they want to schedule any trainings to view as a group in Council Chambers.

C. Report of Staff – *Debra English, Director of Historic and Environmental Preservation*

Director English discussed the items with the Board:

- Asked HARB Members to consider moving the Historic Preservation Awards to the Spring 2022 (May which is Historic Preservation Month) and to continue to review and define the Preservation Awards Checklist to which the Board agreed,
- Asked HARB Members to forward any online seminar training participation hours to Director English for her annual training records (to include four training seminars),
- Asked the Board to review and comment on the Satellite Dish updates to both the Historic District Ordinance and to the *Gettysburg Design Guide*, which would both have to be approved by Borough Council. She said that CLG grant application for the updates to the Ordinance and to the *Gettysburg Design Guide* is available, and that the Adams County Arts Council is working with the Borough to repurpose satellite dishes into functional birdbaths, and
- Discussed the usage of HARB “Thank You for Your Support” hang tags, and to forward a list of any issued hang tag recipients to Director English (direction for distribution to follow).

Other Business

There was no other business before the Board at this time.

Public Comment

There was no public comment.

With no other business before the Board Chair Shaffer made the **motion** to adjourn, and it was seconded by Ms. Hodges. The motion passed **6-to-0**. The meeting adjourned at 8:33 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Karen M. Mesher, Planning and Management Assistant