



**November 17, 2021
Historic Architectural Review Board Minutes
Troxell Council Chambers
Borough of Gettysburg**

Chair Gary Shaffer called the Historical Architectural Review Board Meeting to order at 7:03 PM on Wednesday, November 17, 2021 in Troxell Council Chambers, 59 E. High Street. A quorum of six (6) Board Members was present. Those in attendance were **Board Members:** Chair Gary Shaffer, Vice-Chair Brandon Stone, Joan Hodges, Jim McCabe, Suzanne Christianson, Gettysburg Building Code Official Clem Malot of PA Municipal Code Alliance, Director of Historic and Environmental Preservation Debra English, and Planning Management Assistant Karen Mesher; **Absent Board Member:** Justin Harman; **Others in Attendance:** Ross Hetrick, President of the Thaddeus Stevens Society, representing the erection of the Thaddeus Stevens Statue in front of 111 Baltimore Street-Historic Adams County Courthouse; and Property/Business Owners Tony, Jane and Julie Strickland, Architect Joe Edgar of Snyder's Residential Design LLC, and Architect Gary Shaffer of Shaffer Design Associates PC; all representing 531 Baltimore Street.

Call Meeting to Order

Chair Gary Shaffer called the meeting to order at 7:03 PM in Troxell Council Chambers and conducted a roll call of members in attendance and confirmed a quorum of 6 voting members present.

Introductions and HARB Review Procedures

Chair Shaffer introduced the Board members and explained the procedures that would be followed during the meeting. He explained that only the Board members that were present at that meeting can vote on agenda topics and minutes. He noted that the Board serves as a recommending body to Borough Council, which makes the final decision concerning the issuance of Certificates of Appropriateness. He said that ***"HARB is a design review board only; and that each project must meet all other Borough ordinances and building code requirements prior to final approval through Borough Council."*** Borough Council will next meet on Monday, December 13, 2021.

Review of Agenda and Minutes

Chair Shaffer asked the Board to accept the November 17, 2021 HARB Meeting Agenda as presented. Ms. Hodges made a **motion** to accept the November 17, 2021 HARB Meeting Agenda as presented. The motion was seconded by Ms. Christianson and carried 6-to-0 without dissent.

Chair Shaffer asked the Board to review and accept the October 20, 2021 HARB Meeting Minutes as submitted. Ms. Christianson made a **motion** to accept the October 20, 2021 HARB Meeting Minutes as submitted. The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges and carried 6-to-0 without dissent.

Public Comment for Items Not on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items not on the meeting agenda.

Public Comment for Items on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items on the meeting agenda.

New Business: Applications for Review

(Mr. Shaffer recused himself due to a fiduciary relationship with the following applicant, whereby Mr. Stone assumed the role as Chair.)

A. COA-21-0127 MAJOR PROJECT: 29 Chambersburg Street Hotel – Frictionless Real Estate LLC

Re-construct window on west side of building for proposed restaurant. The terra cotta tile in the storefront will be replaced with wood raised panels, new windows will be installed adding posts and trim for support as well as historical aesthetics. The front doors to each of the dining areas will be moved to the center closer to what they would have been originally. On the west side of the restaurant in the courtyard adjoining the Gettysburger Restaurant and awing window will be installed to allow for customers to access the bar area from the courtyard for orders. The new awing window will be in the opening of an original window that was later bricked in. Existing trim around the leaded glass storefront will remain intact and preserved.

Director English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her October 20, 2021 HARB Meeting Agenda. She said that the structure first appeared on the Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps in 1891 as a four-story brick structure with side 3 and two-story brick structure and rear 2 and one-story frame structure with a one-story rear bowling alley; all with a slate/tin roof the City Hotel. She said that the permit history includes new awnings and exterior paint to the hotel in 2019, and the current project under review.

Mr. Collie, Contractor, Mr. Shaffer, Architect, and Leslie McGraw and Andrew Johnson, Property Owners, gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Mr. Collie said that the applicant would like to preserve the turn-of-the-century front façade including the leaded glass but would like to replace some of the more modern features (such as the transom and sidelights) with historically accurate wooden front doors. He said that the setback for the double entry doors would remain ADA accessible. He would replace the terra cotta bulkhead with wood raised panels and install a new awning window in a previously bricked-in window on the west façade facing the Gettysburger Restaurant so that patrons could access the bar area from the courtyard for their orders. Mr. Shaffer said that he is serving as the Architect of Record for the project, and that the exterior alterations will allow the construction documents to proceed and any code concerns regarding fire safety will be addressed in the UCC permit with those documents.

Vice-Chair Stone presented *The Proposed Findings of Fact* for the Major Project at the Sign of the Buck Tavern and Roadhouse at 29 Chambersburg Street (currently 27 ½). He said that this dwelling of high architectural integrity, is a contributing structure to the Gettysburg Battlefield National Historic District located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District, is a sensitive building over 50 years old at the time of application as defined in the *Code of Ordinances Borough of*

Gettysburg/Gettysburg Historic District and is visible from the public view way via Chambersburg Street and thus comes under the review right of this Board. He said that the proposed façade alterations to the front door and bulkhead and side window is a critical project and is consistent with both the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide*. He noted that all façade alterations are significant architectural importance to the structure's historic integrity.

Ms. Christianson made a **motion** to recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the historical façade restoration that will include new wood panels, doors, windows, posts and trim in the front and an awning window on the west side for the proposed restaurant at 29 Chambersburg Street as presented to the Board in the application dated September 29, 2021 with a project scope that is consistent with both the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide*. The motion was seconded by Mr. Harman and carried **6-to-0 without dissention**.

(Mr. Shaffer resumed his role as Chair.)

B. COA 21-0129 MAJOR PROJECT – 37 Barlow Street, David Monsour

Replace roof shingle to shingle, replace front porch columns from wood to fiberglass, replace wood decking with composite decking, construct a new 24' x 24' garage, expand covered porch with additional 261' decking, new in-kind siding, and repoint chimney.

Director English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her October 20, 2021 HARB Meeting Agenda. She said that the structure first appeared on the Sanborne Fire Insurance Maps in 1931 as a two-story frame structure with a one-story front and rear porch with composite roofing. She noted that the garage roof would be all metal in a colorway that would match the house.

Mr. David Monsour gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. He said that the porch columns would remain the same style but will use alternate wood materials. He said that a mahogany decking would replace the existing wood decking. He would install new siding and replace the roof in-kind. He said that the 24' x 24' garage would be in a blue colorway to match the house. He would restore, if possible, any existing original material when uncovered, and that it could be approved administratively.

Chair Shaffer presented *The Proposed Findings of Fact* for the Major Project at 37 Barlow Street. He said that this dwelling of mixed architectural integrity, is a contributing structure to the Gettysburg Battlefield National Historic District located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District, is a sensitive building over 50 years old at the time of application as defined in the *Code of Ordinances Borough of Gettysburg/Gettysburg Historic District* and is visible from the public view way via Barlow Street and thus comes under the review right of this Board. He said that the proposed porch restoration, siding, and new garage is a critical project and is consistent with both the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide*. He noted that the changes are highly visible and yet minor rehabilitation.

Mr. McCabe made a **motion** to recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace the roof, porch columns and decking, and expand the covered porch on the house and to construct a new rear garage at 37 Barlow Street that is consistent with the *Secretary*

of the *Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide* as presented to the Board in the application dated September 28, 2021. The motion was second by Ms. Christianson and carried **6-to-0 without dissention**.

Reports

A. Consent Agenda Requiring Board Administrative Approval Since the Last Meeting:

NOTE: HARB is a *design review board only*, each project must meet all other Borough Ordinances and Building code requirements.

The Board discussed Item J, COA-21-0141, 110 Chambersburg Street-Philip Schindel, for the installation of an exterior ADA pre-manufactured lift to the second floor roof top decking in order to access a rear 3rd story apartment entrance; and had decided to remove the item for consideration pending the submission of deck railing pictures by the applicant.

Mr. McCabe made the **motion** for the Board to administratively approve the presented Certificates of Appropriateness (COAs) since the October 20, 2021 HARB Business Meeting. The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges and carried **6-to-0**.

B. Report of Chair – Chair Shaffer

Chair Shaffer gave no report.

C. Report of Staff – Debra English, Director of Historic and Environmental Preservation

Director English discussed the items with the Board:

- Asked HARB Members to review the Historic Preservation Awards Checklist, and to provide any new nominations,
- Asked HARB Members to forward any webinar training participation hours to Director English for her annual training records (to include 4 training seminars),
- Asked HARB Members to consider changing meeting time from 7PM-9PM to 6PM-8PM, and the Board decided to keep the current meeting time beginning at 7PM,
- Asked the Board to review and comment on the Satellite Dish updates to both the Historic District Ordinance and to the *Gettysburg Design Guide*, which would both have to be approved by Borough Council. She said that she could submit a CLG Grant application for both updates. She noted that the Borough is working in conjunction with the Adams County Arts Council for repurposing removed satellite dishes into bird baths, and
- Discussed the usage of HARB “Thank You for Your Support” hang tags, and to forward a list of any issued hang tag recipients to Director English (direction for distribution to follow).

Other Business

There was no other business before the Board at this time.

Public Comment

There was no public comment.

With no other business before the Board Chair Shaffer made the **motion** to adjourn, and it was seconded by Ms. Hodges. The motion passed **6-to-0**. The meeting adjourned at 8:45 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Karen M. Mesher, Planning and Management Assistant