



**March 16, 2022**  
**Historic Architectural Review Board Minutes**  
**Troxell Council Chambers**  
**Borough of Gettysburg**

Chair Gary Shaffer called the Historical Architectural Review Board Meeting to order at 7:00 PM on Wednesday, March 16, 2022 in Troxell Council Chambers, 59 E. High Street. A quorum of six (6) Board Members was present. Those in attendance were **Board Members:** Chair Gary Shaffer, Vice-Chair Brandon Stone, Jim McCabe, Justin Harman, Suzanne Christianson, and Gettysburg Building Code Official Clem Malot of PA Municipal Code Alliance, Director of Historic and Environmental Preservation Debra English, and Planning Management Assistant Karen Mesher; **Absent Board Member:** Joan Hodges; **Others in Attendance:** John Shultz, Owner of Americana Souvenirs and Gifts, representing 150 N. Third Street; Brian Shaffer and Bethany Yingling, both from the Gettysburg Foundation, representing the Rupp House History and Children's Museum at 451 Baltimore Street; Marc McLean, Owner of Mr. G's Ice Cream and Miguel Vasquez, Contactor at Miguel Roofing and Siding, both representing 404 Baltimore Street; Jose Barrera-Duque and Joshua Joseph, both from Alam B Roofing and Home Improvements LLC, representing 57 Breckenridge Street.

**Call Meeting to Order**

Chair Gary Shaffer called the meeting to order at 7:00 PM in Troxell Council Chambers and conducted a roll call of members in attendance and confirmed a quorum of six (6) voting members present.

**Introductions and HARB Review Procedures**

Chair Shaffer introduced the Board members and explained the procedures that would be followed during the meeting. He explained that only the Board members that were present at that meeting can vote on agenda topics and minutes. He noted that the Board serves as a recommending body to Borough Council, which makes the final decision concerning the issuance of Certificates of Appropriateness. He said that ***"HARB is a design review board only; and that each project must meet all other Borough ordinances and building code requirements prior to final approval through Borough Council."*** Borough Council will next meet on Monday, April 11, 2022.

**Review of Agenda and Minutes**

Chair Shaffer asked the Board to accept the March 16, 2022 HARB Meeting Agenda as presented. Vice-Chair Stone made a **motion** to accept the March 16, 2022 HARB Meeting Agenda as presented. The motion was seconded by Ms. Christianson and **carried 6-to-0 by roll call vote without dissention.**

Chair Shaffer asked the Board to review and accept the February 16, 2022 HARB Meeting Minutes as submitted. Vice Chair Stone requested that "51 E. Middle Street" be changed to "51 W. Middle Street" under Reports, Administrative Approvals, COA-220008. Mr. Malot made a **motion** to accept the February

16, 2022 HARB Meeting Minutes as amended. The motion was seconded by Mr. Harman and **carried 4-to-0 by roll call vote without dissent** (Mr. McCabe and Ms. Christianson abstained).

#### **Public Comment for Items Not on the Agenda**

There were no public comments for items not on the meeting agenda.

#### **Public Comment for Items on the Agenda**

There were no public comments for items on the meeting agenda.

#### **New Business: Applications for Review**

##### **A. COA-22-0015 Major Project: 150 N. Third Street – Timely Place LLC, Jon Shultz**

Remove the existing shingled roof and replace it with a multi-rib metal roof system with the necessary flashings, accessories, and matching snow guards. All exterior detail areas will be replicated to match the existing areas. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.

Director English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her project scope from her March 16, 2022 HARB Meeting Agenda. She said that the structure first appeared on the Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps in 1931 as a one-story brick structure known as the Reaser Furniture Company. The permit history shows 2016 roofing work, 2017 removal of wood loading dock and construction of new masonry dock, 2018 rubber roofing work, 2021 partial roofing work, and 2022 current permit for the remaining roofing work. Staff recommends approving application as submitted.

Mr. Jon Shultz, Owner of Americana Souvenirs and Gifts, gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Mr. Shultz said that he would like to remove the existing shingled roof, install synthetic felt over the entire deck, install a new 2X Purlin System over the existing roof deck, and install a multi-rib metal roof system with all necessary flashings, accessories and matching snowguards.

Chair Shaffer presented *The Proposed Findings of Fact* for the Major Project at 150 N. Third Street. He said that this dwelling is a contributing to the Gettysburg Battlefield National Historic District located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District, is a sensitive building over 50 years old at the time of application as defined in the *Code of Ordinances Borough of Gettysburg/Gettysburg Historic District* and is visible from the public view way via N. Third Street and Race Horse Alley and thus comes under the review right of this Board. He said that the proposed roof replacement is a project that consistent with both the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide*. He noted that the structure has critical design elements noting the windows, brick masonry, and overall length of the historic factory building.

Ms. Christianson made a **motion** to recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the roof replacement at 150 N. Third Street as presented to the Board in the application dated January 20, 2022 with a project scope that is consistent with both the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide*. The motion was seconded by Mr. Malot and carried **6-to-0 by roll call vote without dissent**.

**B. COA 22-0025 MAJOR PROJECT: 451 Baltimore Street, The Rupp House – Gettysburg Foundation**

Replace the existing wood floor decking on the front porch with Treks floor decking. The existing flooring is comprised of 3.25-inch wooden boards in a gray color. This floor is also the roof to the building's basement where rain and snow currently penetrate. Composite-textured wood style decking will increase patron safety and durability. The proposed decking boards are Americana in pewter gray color and are 3 1/8 inches wide. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.

Director English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her March 16, 2022 HARB Meeting Agenda. She said that the structure first appeared on the Sanborne Fire Insurance Maps in 1902 as a frame two-story dwelling with a shingled roof and a one-story framed porch with a tin/slate roof. There is a rear attached brick two-story building with a shingled roof and a north facing side that has a one-story porch with a tin/slate roof. The permit history includes an event tent in 2019, a Banner Permit in 2020, and Amusement Licenses in 2018, 2019, 2020, 2021, and 2022. Staff recommends the approval of this application for the change of decking material from wood to synthetic wood-patterned material in the same color; and the change will not alter the look of the front façade of the structure. The *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* #6 states that "deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced; but when the severity of the deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities, and where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence."

Bryan Shaffer and Bethany Yingling from the Gettysburg Foundation gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Ms. Yingling said that the 1868 porch decking is deteriorating, and that it is currently patched when needed. She said that the porch floor is the roof over the building's basement, and that water seeps into that area. She said that the Gettysburg Foundation would like to use Treks flooring for maintenance, longevity, and aesthetics. The Board discussed the replacement of the porch columns relative to the existing decking, inquiring if the columns could be restored. Director English stated that partial replacement could receive administrative approval to remediate any problems relative to the flooring; but noted that any total wholesale replacement of those columns would require HARB approval and would require both Borough and PMCA UCC building permits. Vice-Chair Stone noted the board edging, and that it could be concealed using a breadboard edging cover to conceal the board gaps.

Chair Shaffer presented *The Proposed Findings of Fact* for the Major Project at 451 Baltimore Street. He said that this dwelling is of high architectural integrity, is a contributing structure to the Gettysburg Battlefield National Historic District located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District, is a sensitive building over 50 years old at the time of application as defined in the *Code of Ordinances Borough of Gettysburg/Gettysburg Historic District* and is visible from the public view way via Baltimore Street and thus comes under the review right of this Board. He said that the proposed critical building alterations to the porch floor decking to repair a deteriorated floor/basement roof will not impact the historic look of the porch structure and is consistent with other porches in the Historic District in accordance with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide*. He noted that the porch columns will need to be replaced at some point in the future.

Vice-Chair Stone made a **motion** to recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace the deteriorated porch floor with Treks floor decking at 451 Baltimore

Street that is consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide* as presented to the Board in the application dated February 23, 2022. The motion was second by Mr. McCabe and carried **6-to-0 by roll call vote without dissention.**

**C. COA 22-0019 MAJOR PROJECT: 404 Baltimore Street, Mr. G's Ice Cream – Michael Glatfelter**

Replace the existing commercial asbestos roof shingles with a corrugated black metal roof, roof support forest step wood 1 x 3, and install new metal drip edge, new valley at dormers, new flashing at dormers and chimney, and metal roof with screws, new ridge vent, and pipe boots all in black colorway. Repair, paint, caulk windows (windows and frames to remain wood and not wrapped in aluminum). All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.

Director English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her March 16, 2022 HARB Meeting Agenda. She said that the structure first appeared on the Sanborne Fire Insurance Maps in 1896 as a two-story brick structure with a shingled-style roof, frame two-story side and one-story rear porch; three attached side/rear one-story brick and two frame out building structures, and two detached one-story brick and frame structures. The permit history includes: paint/repair exterior wood on house, paint/repair cement block, replace privacy hedge with mid-19<sup>th</sup> century-style white picket fence in 1990; add twin double-hung windows in gable ends of building at peak of roof, and replicate existing windows in 1993; replace rear window to entrance door in 2000; replace sidewalk in 2010; replace brick in 50 sf of sidewalk along Baltimore Street; renovate interior for ice cream parlor (violation to install address numbers) in 2011; install signage for Mr. G's in 2012. Staff recommends the denial of change in roofing material from asbestos to metal and recommends using a roof system replicating a similar style such as synthetic slate. The *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* #6 states that "deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced; but when the severity of the deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities, and where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence."

Marc Mclean, new owner of Mr. G's Ice Cream, and Miguel Vasquez Contractor at Miguel Roofing and Siding gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Mr. Vasquez said that the current roof is rotting on one side and is an eyesore. He stated that metal roofs were possible styles in the late 1800s; and he would like to replace the existing asbestos shingled roof using proper mediation procedures with a corrugated black metal roof that is cost effective for the applicant. He would also like to restore and paint wood windows. Chair Shaffer stated that a metal roof is inappropriate for this high-profile historic structure, and that the existing roof could be replaced with wavy style, GAF 35-year shingles in perhaps a gray color way that would mimic slate to match current shingles roof on detached gift shop. He said that an appropriate asphalt shingle that would mimic the current shingle would be approved pending HARB review of a sample.

Mr. Mclean withdrew his submitted February 20, 2022 application and will resubmit a revised scope using an asphalt shingle, gutter styles, and any work performed. Director English advised that the applicant could repair/replace the windows framing as in-kind maintenance to include caulking and painting. Mr. Mclean said that his business would remain open during limited construction times.

**D. COA 22-0024 MAJOR PROJECT: 57 Breckenridge Street – Joshua Joseph**

Remove existing white aluminum 8-inch flat profile siding and match it with white vinyl 8-inch flat profile siding, Tyvek house, vinyl corner posts, J-channel, starter strip and accessories will be installed. Remove existing white aluminum K-style gutters and replace with new white aluminum K-style gutters. Cap the uncapped windows with white aluminum trim coil to match the existing aluminum trim on the windows, wrap wood fascia and rake with white aluminum. Install solid white vinyl soffit across first- and second-story soffits. Install black twisted wrought iron handrail to match the existing hand rail on the concrete steps using epoxy concrete to be bored out and handrail inserted. It may be necessary to repair steps. Build new rear deck, porch for egress point to second floor with 6' x 6' platform using pressure treated posts and lumber, remove window for door entryway, replace with half-light smoked glass entry door, and insulate trim door entry way. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.

Director English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her March 16, 2022 HARB Meeting Agenda. She said that the structure first appeared on the Sanborne Fire Insurance Maps in 1931 as a three-story frame structure with a slate/tin roof, and a framed garage outbuilding structure. The permit history includes repairing internal/external fire damage to previous condition before fire in 2006, notice to file no work conducted to date in 2008, snow violation in 2012, Regulated Rental Unit Occupancy Licenses from 2017-2022. Staff recommends the approval of this application as submitted.

Joshua Joseph and Jose Barrera-Duque gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Mr. Joseph said that they would like to replace the existing 8-inch siding using Tyvek house wrap to all elevations, and install vinyl corner posts, J-channel, starter strips and accessories, and remove existing white vinyl siding with a white vinyl match. Mr. Barrera said that the homeowner would like to build a small porch on the back of the house. Chair Shaffer said the porch addition would require drawings for review of UCC code; and stated that Historic District Guidelines oppose wrapping fascia but encourage painting wood, and that a change in materials could require a review of color. Vice-Chair Stoned recommended using existing porch on second floor for egress. Mr. Malot said that second floor windows would serve as emergency egress if needed. Chair Shaffer said that handrails are required on steps, so could install black twisted handrail if supported by drawings which are needed for this scope; and he noted the building has significantly changed since 1974 so cannot restore historic material if already using alternative materials. Vice-Chair said that he would approve project if scope was adjusted to meet the historic district guidelines.

Chair Shaffer presented *The Proposed Findings of Fact* for the Major Project at 57 Breckenridge Street. He said that this dwelling is non-descript 1960-1970 remodeled-style with little historical references remaining, is a contributing structure to the Gettysburg Battlefield National Historic District located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District, is a sensitive building over 50 years old at the time of application as defined in the *Code of Ordinances Borough of Gettysburg/Gettysburg Historic District* and is visible from the public view way via Breckenridge Street and thus comes under the review right of this Board. He said that the proposed building alterations to the 8-inch aluminum siding on all elevations to a compromised building to an 8-inch smooth profile vinyl material will not impact the historic look of the aluminum siding with wood elements maintained and would be an accepted change according to the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide* to reflect that the front façade would have wood-trimmed elements and not wrapped. He said that there is not enough information for the rear porch and side stair to date.

Vice-Chair Stone made a **motion** to recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the replacement of the 8-inch aluminum siding with an 8-inch smooth vinyl siding at 57 Breckenridge Street as defined with an adjusted scope of work that would reflect that the front façade of the building would have wood trim elements that is consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide* as presented to the Board in the application dated January 23, 2022. The motion was second by Ms. Christianson and carried **6-to-0 by roll call vote without dissent.**

## **Reports**

### **A. Consent Agenda Requiring Board Administrative Approval Since the Last Meeting:**

- **COA 22-0016 MINOR PROJECT: 35 Carlisle Street – Graphic ID**  
Installation of a 4' x 5' projecting sign for Gettysburg Lincoln Railroad Station. Sign must not project more than 4 feet from building façade, and the bottom of the sign must be at least eight feet above the sidewalk. 20 SF sign allocation used and 13 SF available. Signage must be anchored in the mortar, and not within the existing brick. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.
- **COA 22-0017 MINOR PROJECT: 310 N. Stratton Street – Bergier Family Holdings LLC**  
EPDM to EPMD roof replacement on existing rear rubber roof sections only. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.
- **COA 22-0018 MINOR PROJECT: 444 Baltimore Street – Duncan Bardo LLC**  
Removal of laundry room enclosure and installation of doorway to exterior, and construction of rear exterior stairs from existing balcony for egress from second floor rooms. Rear of structure not visible from the public roadway. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.
- **COA 21-0020 MINOR PROJECT: 18 Carlisle Street – Tracy Lynn LLC**  
Installation of 6' x 4.83' window decal sign for Caruso Homes with 29 SF of signage used. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.
- **COA 22-0021 MINOR PROJECT: 22 Carlisle Street – Gettysburg LLC C/O CD Miller**  
Installation of one 40" x 48" projecting sign not to project more than 4 feet from the face of the building, installation of two 2' x 3' window decals on store windows for 'Kip & Idle Home, Re-loved Furniture + Décor' with 26 SF total signage used, and no additional sign allocation remaining. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.

**NOTE:** HARB is a *design review board only*, each project must meet all other Borough Ordinances and Building code requirements prior to final approval through Council.

Vice-Chair Stone made the **motion** for the Board to administratively approve the presented Certificates of Appropriateness (COAs) since the February 16, 2022 HARB Business Meeting. The motion was seconded by Ms. Christianson and **carried 6-to-0 by roll call vote without dissent.**

## B. Report of Chair – *Chair Shaffer*

Chair Shaffer discussed with the Board their review of Historic District Properties with applicants, and that they must cite their reasoning noting the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.

## C. Report of Staff – *Debra English, Director of Historic and Environmental Preservation*

Director English discussed the items with the Board:

- Reviewed the Historic Preservation Awards Checklist with HARB members for the HARB Preservation Awards Ceremony to be held on Wednesday, May 18, 2022 at 6PM-7PM in Troxell Council Chambers, 59 E. High Street,
- Asked the Board to continue their review and to comment on the Satellite Dish updates for both the Historic District Ordinance and to the *Gettysburg Design Guide*, which would both have to be approved by Borough Council,
- Discussed the grant opportunity to reinventory properties in the Gettysburg Historic District, and that the item will be placed in next year's budget,
- Announced that Mr. Frank Grumbine, Central Pennsylvania Community Preservation Coordinator will be the guest speaker at the April 20, 2022 HARB Meeting,
- Discussed a HARB Scavenger Hunt with the Board,
- Discussed the re-inventorying of the Gettysburg Historic District with the Board,
- Discussed the usage of HARB "Thank You for Your Support" hang tags, and to forward a list of any issued hang tag recipients to Director English (direction for distribution to follow), and
- Asked HARB Members to forward any online seminar training participation hours to Director English for her annual training records (to include 4 training seminars).

## Other Business

There was no other business before the Board at this time.

## Public Comment

There was no public comment.

With no other business before the Board Chair Shaffer made the **motion** to adjourn, and it was seconded by Vice-Chair Stone. The **motion passed 6-to-0**. The meeting adjourned at 9:42 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Karen M. Mesher, Planning and Management Assistant