

DRAFT



February 16, 2022
Historic Architectural Review Board Minutes
Troxell Council Chambers
Borough of Gettysburg

Chair Gary Shaffer called the Historical Architectural Review Board Meeting to order at 7:00 PM on Wednesday, February 16, 2022 in Troxell Council Chambers, 59 E. High Street. A quorum of four (4) Board Members was present. Those in attendance were **Board Members:** Chair Gary Shaffer, Vice-Chair Brandon Stone, Justin Harman, and Gettysburg Building Code Official Clem Malot of PA Municipal Code Alliance, Director of Historic and Environmental Preservation Debra English, and Planning Management Assistant Karen Mesher; **Absent Board Members:** Joan Hodges, Jim McCabe, Suzanne Christianson, **Others in Attendance:** Jim Biesecker, Gettysburg College Executive Director of Facilities Planning and Management, and Chris Elwood, Gettysburg College Director of Capital Projects, both representing 249 Carlisle Street-Carlisle House; Brandon Shelton of Front Runner Exteriors LLC representing 34 Breckenridge Street.

Call Meeting to Order

Chair Gary Shaffer called the meeting to order at 7:00 PM in Troxell Council Chambers and conducted a roll call of members in attendance and confirmed a quorum of four (4) voting members present.

Introductions and HARB Review Procedures

Chair Shaffer introduced the Board members and explained the procedures that would be followed during the meeting. He explained that only the Board members that were present at that meeting can vote on agenda topics and minutes. He noted that the Board serves as a recommending body to Borough Council, which makes the final decision concerning the issuance of Certificates of Appropriateness. He said that ***"HARB is a design review board only; and that each project must meet all other Borough ordinances and building code requirements prior to final approval through Borough Council."*** Borough Council will next meet on Monday, March 14, 2022.

Review of Agenda and Minutes

Chair Shaffer asked the Board to accept the February 16, 2022 HARB Meeting Agenda as presented. Vice-Chair Stone made a **motion** to accept the February 16, 2022 HARB Meeting Agenda as presented. The motion was seconded by Mr. Malot and carried **4-to-0** without dissention.

Chair Shaffer asked the Board to review and accept the January 19, 2022 HARB Meeting Minutes as submitted. Vice-Chair Stone made a **motion** to accept the January 19, 2022 HARB Meeting Minutes as submitted. The motion was seconded by Mr. Malot and carried **4-to-0** without dissention.

Public Comment for Items Not on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items not on the meeting agenda.

Public Comment for Items on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items on the meeting agenda.

New Business: Applications for Review

A. COA-22-0009 Major Project: 249 Carlisle Street – Gettysburg College “Carlisle House”

Install aluminum-clad windows on the non-street facing side of the house and install new wooden windows on the Carlisle Street side of the property. All windows will be replaced in the same style and detail similar to what is currently in place in accordance with the design guidelines. All exterior detail areas will be replicated to match the existing areas. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.

Director English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her February 16, 2022 HARB Meeting Agenda. She said that the structure first appeared on the Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps in 1902 as a two-story brick structure with front-framed porch with a slate/tin roof; and with a one-story framed structure with a shingled roof. The permit history shows the property as a Regulated Rental Unit (RRUO) since 2018, had a permit for interior renovations in 2019, and includes this permit for the window replacement.

Chris Elwood and Jim Biesecker representing Gettysburg College gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Mr. Biesecker said that the College would like to replace the failing windows on the non-street side of the Carlisle House with aluminum-clad replacement windows from Loewen Window Center in Maryland; and install new wooden windows on the Carlisle Street front façade. He said that the College first bought the building in 1954, and it was Delta Kappa Rho in 1958; and the College regained the building as a residence hall in 1975 with 25 occupants. He said that they have exhausted all efforts to maintain and repair the existing window units in order to provide a safe environment for their students with functioning windows. He said that all windows will be replaced in the same style and detail as what is currently there to keep within the design guidelines, noting that the current window trims are white in color and the new windows would remain that color. He said that all exterior detail areas would replicate the existing areas. Mr. Elwood said that the new Loewen wooden windows would replicate the same style and lights as the current windows which are double hung. The side windows have half rounds, and some windows have diamond light pattern from 1915. The air conditioning units have caused rot in the sills due to moisture. He said that the half round windows on the third floor are included in the project scope, but the cellar window are not included at this time. He said that Facilities have carpenters on staff to address immediate window issues; but would like to provide operational windows for their students. He noted that windows do have weights that were original to 1954; and that the structure was built in 1902. He would like to replace the side and rear elevations with aluminum clad in the existing profile, and that AC units would transfer from room to room depending on student medical needs. He said that after a fire, there were hodge-podge window replacements; and the North, South, and East windows are aluminum clad. Chair Shaffer said that the one-over-one window design is not significant, but the casing is significant. Mr. Biesecker said that the College would donate the removed windows to the Architectural

Warehouse/Salvage Yard; and stressed that the proposed front windows would be wood, and the side/rear windows would be wood-clad.

Chair Shaffer presented *The Proposed Findings of Fact* for the Major Project at 249 Carlisle Street. He said that this dwelling of high architectural integrity with many historical features, is a contributing to the Gettysburg Battlefield National Historic District located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District, is a sensitive building over 50 years old at the time of application as defined in the *Code of Ordinances Borough of Gettysburg/Gettysburg Historic District* and is visible from the public view way via both Stevens and Carlisle Streets and thus comes under the review right of this Board. He said that the proposed window replacement to the front façade with wood windows and the side/rear facades is a project that consistent with both the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide*. He noted that all North/West/South facades are visible from the public view way via Carlisle and Stevens Streets, and the proposed replacement will replicate the existing windows with storms and sash.

Vice-Chair Stone made a **motion** to recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the wholesale replacement of wood windows with custom wood and wood-clad windows to match the historic profiles and details to include all three dormers with the arch design will be replaced with wood at 249 Carlisle Street as presented to the Board in the application dated January 19, 2022 with a project scope that is consistent with both the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide*. The motion was seconded by Mr. Harman and carried **4-to-0 by voice vote without dissention**.

B. COA 22-0013 MAJOR PROJECT: 34 Breckenridge Street – George and Joanne C. Mitchell

Remove existing historic tin roof with inlay to replace with a standing seam metal roof in black. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.

Director English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her February 16, 2022 HARB Meeting Agenda. She said that the structure first appeared on the Sanborne Fire Insurance Maps in 1886 as a frame two-story structure with a one-story rear frame porch both with a shingled roof. The permit history includes October 2009 violation for garbage/refuse clean-up; an August 2009 violation for tall grass; and a 1989 violation for garbage/refuse clean-up; and this application for a new roof.

Brandon Shelton from Front Runner Exteriors LLC gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Mr. Shelton said that the roof is deteriorating, and that coating would leave air pockets under shingles. He said that he understands the historical value of the fishtail pattern, which is hard to find, but would like to propose a standing seam metal roof in black colorway to maintain the historic look that is affordable to the applicant. Chair Shaffer said that the fishtail design element dates back to the 1800s and is a 100-year-old design element. He noted that the structure appeared on the Sanborne Fire Insurance Maps in 1886, and that the roof is stamped fishtail tin shingles. He said that homes on Breckenridge and Washington Streets exhibit the look from the Civil War; and that HARB usually recommends using fishtail on the front and alternate materials on the side/rear elevations. Mr. Shelton proposed a straight seam with a one-inch rise, restore any crown molding or dental molding, and would recommend any work proposed outside of the scope. He said that he would not use corrugated metal but will use rolled standing seam. Chair Shaffer said that there are metal shingles

used on homes on Stratton Street. Mr. Shelton said that the back side of the roof descends into a rubber roof then into an asphalt shingled porch roof.

Chair Shaffer presented *The Proposed Findings of Fact* for the Major Project at 34 Breckenridge Street. He said that this dwelling is a contributing structure to the Gettysburg Battlefield National Historic District located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District, is a sensitive building over 50 years old at the time of application as defined in the *Code of Ordinances Borough of Gettysburg/Gettysburg Historic District* and is visible in a limited way from the public view way via Breckenridge Street and thus comes under the review right of this Board. He said that the proposed critical building alterations to the roof to repair a poorly maintained fishtail shingled roof and does not replicate the existing roof design but is consistent with other roofs in the Historic District in accordance with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide*.

Vice-Chair Stone made a **motion** to recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace the deteriorated tin fishtail roof with a black standing seam metal roof with snowbirds at 34 Breckenridge Street that is consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide* as presented to the Board in the application dated January 3, 2022. The motion was second by Mr. Malot and carried **4-to-0 without dissent**.

Chair Shaffer made a **motion** to recommend that the applicant salvage the fishtail shingles after removal. The motion was seconded by Vice-Chair Stone and carried **4-to-0 by voice vote without dissent**.

Reports

A. Consent Agenda Requiring Board Administrative Approval Since the Last Meeting:

- a. **COA 22-0008 MINOR PROJECT: 51 W. Middle Street – Marguerite L. Brownley**
Repair water damage and re-roof side entry porch with 'in kind' materials. Metal to metal re-roof and support reconstruction as needed under roofing material. Original beams and posts must remain. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.
- b. **COA 22-0010 MINOR PROJECT: 204 Chambersburg – Joel Hossler**
Replace existing roof on main building with Drexel metal roof in 'classic bronze' color. Install rubber roof on transition area between main building and small garage extension to rear. Garage roof will not be replaced at this time. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.
- c. **COA 22-0011 MINOR PROJECT: 37 Breckenridge Street – SPG Capitol**
Interior work: add new flooring, replace basement stairs, rotted wood posts in basement with steel posts, add plumbing for washer, install electrical circuits for washer, hood fan, and baseboard heaters in bathrooms, update all electrical devices and fixtures. Exterior work: replace wood steps at front porch with treated lumber. Railings and spindles must not be removed with renovations to front steps. Any other work outside of step replacement will require permit review. All work and style of material must be 'in kind'. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.

d. COA 21-0012 MINOR PROJECT: 111 Baltimore Street, Historic Court House - Thaddeus Stevens Sign

Installation of 2'x3' historical marker standing 4' high on an aluminum base to the north of the proposed Thaddeus Stevens statue. No part of the proposed statue installation shall be located within the PennDOT Right-of-Way. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.

e. COA 21-0014 MINOR PROJECT: 45 W. High Street – Adams County Rehab

Install one 19"x16" aluminum hanging sign with lettering 'The Rase Project' from a new wrought iron bracket above the building entrance. Signage must be anchored within the mortar joints and not through the brick on the structure. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.

NOTE: HARB is a *design review board only*, each project must meet all other Borough Ordinances and Building code requirements prior to final approval through Council.

Vice-Chair Stone made the **motion** for the Board to administratively approve the presented Certificates of Appropriateness (COAs) since the January 19, 2022 HARB Business Meeting. The motion was seconded by Mr. Harman and carried **4-to-0**.

B. Report of Chair – Chair Shaffer

Chair Shaffer gave no report but discussed the HARB Awards with the Board. He suggested that awards not be given to cited properties, belligerent, or confrontational applicants, noting that these properties should not be recognized if the project was a struggle. He recommended comparing the Power Point of the proposed properties to the awards list. He suggested April 20th for the HARB Awards ceremony date, and that all Board recommendations should be submitted to Director English no later than March 9th in advance of the March 16th HARB meeting for final review. He asked the Board to consider recognizing the GAR Building for a Good Steward Award for their care of the 200-year-old building; and proposed also recognizing it with an Exceptional Merit Award,

C. Report of Staff – Debra English, Director of Historic and Environmental Preservation

Director English discussed the items with the Board:

- Asked HARB Members to review the Historic Preservation Awards Checklist for the final review at the March meeting,
- Asked the Board to review and comment on the Satellite Dish updates to both the Historic District Ordinance and to the *Gettysburg Design Guide*, which would both have to be approved by Borough Council. She said that she could submit a CLG Grant application for both updates. She noted that the Borough is working in conjunction with the Adams County Arts Council for repurposing removed satellite dishes into bird baths,
- Discussed the grant opportunity to reinventory properties in the Gettysburg Historic District, and that the item will be placed in next year's budget,
- Discussed the usage of HARB "Thank You for Your Support" hang tags, and to forward a list of any issued hang tag recipients to Director English (direction for distribution to follow), and

- Asked HARB Members to forward any online seminar training participation hours to Director English for her annual training records (to include 4 training seminars),

Other Business

There was no other business before the Board at this time.

Public Comment

There was no public comment.

With no other business before the Board Chair Shaffer made the **motion** to adjourn, and it was seconded by Vice-Chair Stone. The motion passed **7-to-0**. The meeting adjourned at 8:40 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Karen M. Mesher, Planning and Management Assistant