

August 19, 2015
Historic Architectural Review Board Minutes
Borough of Gettysburg

Chair Gary Shaffer called the Historic Architectural Review Board (HARB) meeting to order at 7:00 PM on Wednesday, August 19, 2015. The meeting was held in Council Chambers of the Borough Building, 59 East High Street. A quorum was present. Those in attendance were: Board members Peggy Gustafson, Joan Hodges, Colleen Lingle, Jim McCabe and Clem Malot; Scott Dellett, Borough Planning Director; and Karen Mesher, Borough Management Assistant. Also in attendance were: Toby Cool of Coldsmith Roofing Inc., representing 150 North Third Street; Jenni Cullison representing 331 South Washington Street; William Baldwin and Jim Biesecker of Gettysburg College representing 25 Carlisle Street; and David Petters of KADEL/Blue & Gray Bar & Grill, representing 2 Baltimore Street. Board Member Philip Goble was absent.

Review of Agenda and Minutes

There were no changes to the meeting agenda. Mr. Malot moved to approve the minutes of the July 15, 2015 meeting. Ms. Lingle seconded the motion. The **motion** passed, 6-to-0.

Mr. Shaffer introduced the members and explained the procedures that would be followed during the meeting. He noted that the Board serves as an advisory group to Borough Council, which makes final decisions concerning the issuance of Certificates of Appropriateness. He asked that the applicants identify themselves for the record before speaking. Borough Council will next meet on Monday, September 14, 2015.

Public Comment for Items Not on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items not on the meeting agenda.

New Applications for Certificates of Appropriateness

- A. COA-15-39 Jon Shultz, 150 North Third Street. Alteration. Replace existing roof with a new roof.**

Mr. Dellett presented the *Background Information* as depicted in the Board Memorandum dated August 13, 2015:

BUILDING HISTORY

The structures were part of the Reaser Furniture Co., which built furniture at the site in the early 20th Century. In 1907 Clayton S. Reaser purchased the two-year-old Engle Furniture Co., part of the Gettysburg Manufacturing Co., and renamed it Reaser Furniture Manufacturing Co., which made buffets, sideboards, hall racks, dressers, wash stands and library tables, most of oak or mahogany. Reaser later purchased the

remaining stock of the Gettysburg Manufacturing Co. and together his companies were known as Gettysburg Furniture Co. Reaser died in 1918 but his company was expanded to include the Gettysburg Panel Co. in 1920 to provide veneer and the Gettysburg Chair Co. in 1923 to make chairs. In 1951 the factories were sold to Sidney Rose of Cincinnati. The Gettysburg Furniture Co. factory closed in 1960; the building became a warehouse and distribution point for Rose's other furniture factories outside Pennsylvania. Dolly Madison Industries, Furniture Division, took over the facility in 1966.

Mr. Shaffer said that the applicant sought to change the roofing material used, thereby requiring that the application be brought before the Board. He explained that minor projects could be approved administratively per the ordinance if the changes do not impact the appearance or corrections with the same material; but if the Board does not object to the material changes used, the Board could approve the project administratively.

Mr. Toby Cool, the roofing contractor for the applicant, gave a brief presentation. He said that over nine different roofs were installed on the structure over time. He said that the applicant wanted to replace the existing roof with a metal roof or a GAF Timberline HD architectural shingle roof in lieu of metal. He said that the intent was to replace the roof with a metal roof, making one uniform roof. Ms. Gustafson asked if the metal roof would blend into the shingle roof. Mr. Cool said that there would be no difference visually between the two roofs. He said that the roof would have to be retrussed if shingles were used, but humps could be eliminated with a metal roof. Mr. Shaffer said that the preferred roof is the metal roof. Ms. Gustafson asked if the metal roof was a standing seam roof or had a more corrugated look. Mr. Cool said that the metal roof would have a more corrugated look.

Ms. Malot made the **motion** the Board recommends that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for 150 North Third Street to replace the existing roof with a metal roof using the materials presented in the building application dated July 20, 2015. . The motion was seconded by Mr. McCabe. The motion carried 6-to-0.

Mr. Shaffer said that the ensuing discussion led the Board to release the Certificate of Appropriateness by administrative approval.

B. COA-15-42 Danny and Jenni Cullison, 331 South Washington Street. Demolition / New Construction. Remove an existing rusted tin shed and replace it with a pre-made A-frame wooden shed.

Mr. Dellett presented the *Background Information* as depicted in the Board Memorandum dated August 13, 2015:

BUILDING HISTORY

The two-story dwelling at 331 South Washington Street first appeared on the Borough's 1912 Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps.

Ms. Cullison, the applicant, responded to questions from the Board. She said that her intent was to remove the rusted shed and replace it with a pre-made A-frame wooden shed with a board and batten exterior. Mr. McCabe asked if the new building would be the same size as the previous one. She explained that the old shed was 12 feet by 18 feet and that the new shed would be 10 feet by 18 feet. She said that the new shed would have two side windows and double doors to the rear of the structure. She noted that the shed would have a rustic brown stain color and a brown metal roof.

Ms. Gustafson made the **motion** the Board recommends Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for 331 South Washington Street using the materials as presented in the application dated August 2, 2015. The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges. The motion passed 6-to-0.

C. COA-15-341 Gettysburg College / Majestic Theater, 25 Carlisle Street. Alteration. Construction of an accessible sidewalk ramp with a metal railing.

Mr. Dellett presented the *Background Information* as depicted in the Board Memorandum dated August 13, 2015:

BUILDING HISTORY

The Majestic Theater opened on November 14, 1925 with the Cecil B. DeMille movie "The Road to Yesterday". With 1,200 seats, including a balcony, the Majestic Theater opened as the largest vaudeville and silent movie theater in south-central Pennsylvania. Designed by the prominent Philadelphia architect William H. Lee, the Majestic Theater was built by Henry Scharf, manager of the historic Hotel Gettysburg, as an annex to the hotel. Since early-1990, Gettysburg College has owned the theater. By 1941 it was operated by Warner Bros. Circuit Management Corp.

In the 1950's, the Majestic Theater stepped onto the world stage when President Dwight D. Eisenhower and First Lady Mamie Eisenhower regularly attended performances, often in the company of world leaders. The theater's ballroom/gymnasium (now renovated to function as two cinemas) was often used by the White House press corps for news conferences when President Eisenhower was in residence at his Gettysburg farm.

In 1983, a fire destroyed the Gettysburg Hotel, which had been converted to low-income housing, and the Majestic Theater sustained water damage. In 1984, the Majestic Theater was reopened and converted into a triplex cinema (not the same triplex configuration as today).

The theater closed in March 2014 for a \$16 million restoration and reopened on November 14, 2005, the 80th anniversary of its first opening night. John Milner Architects were employed for the restoration, with the architectural firm Killis Almond Associates.

Included in this memorandum is “A Majestic Presence: A Study of the Development of the Majestic Theater in Gettysburg” published by the Gettysburg Historic Journal in 2002.

Mr. Biesecker and Mr. Baldwin gave a brief presentation and answered questions from the Board. Mr. Biesecker said that the intent by Gettysburg College was to add an ADA compliant entrance to the Majestic Theater. He said that the location of the handicapped ramp will be in front of the Flats Restaurant and under the Theater marquis which is the main entrance. Mr. Baldwin said that there will be signage inside the Majestic Theater directing patrons to an elevator that will take them to the second floor. Ms. Gustafson asked what the handicapped handrail would look like at the end. Mr. Shaffer said that the preference is to return the handrail to the ground at the end. Mr. Malot said that some clarification about the handrail is needed before it is built, and asked if it will be located in the public right-of-way. Mr. Dellett said that the normal procedure is to have the handicapped ramp plans reviewed by a building code official and an ADA consultant, and he noted that Gettysburg College is addressing ADA issues. Mr. Biesecker said that the intent was to have accessibility to the Majestic Theater by all patrons, and Mr. Baldwin stated that the entrance access way should be under the marquis. Mr. Shaffer said that the handicapped ramp slopes up toward the marquis only four inches, and that the guard rail is to protect people from stepping off of the ramp. He noted that there will be a secondary curb and drop-off in the middle of the sidewalk, and that the Majestic Theater has both black and polished chrome elements. He said that the Board should focus their attention on the ramp’s specific location.

Mr. Baldwin asked if the final ramp design could be administratively approved. Mr. Shaffer explained that a final design will be reviewed by both Mr. Malot and Mr. Dellet, and that it would be accepted if it was not radically altered.

Mr. Shaffer presented the *Proposed Findings of Fact*:

- The structure at 25 Carlisle Street is a sensitive building, as defined in Chapter 11 of the Borough Code of Ordinances, Historic Districts (Historic District Ordinance). A sensitive building is defined as a building that has been standing for at least 50 years at the time of application, even though it has been considerably modified and certain sites of later historic significance or buildings that the Board has determined to be exemplary of later architectural styles.

- The proposed work is a permanent change, making this proposal a critical project, which is defined in the Historic Districts Ordinance as "A project involving demolition of all or part of any building or change in configuration and rhythm of any building as a whole, or any alteration to a sensitive building."
- The building is a contributing structure to the Gettysburg Battlefield National Register Historic District.

Ms. Gustafson made the **motion** the Board recommends Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for 25 Carlisle Street using the materials and plans as presented in the application dated August 5, 2015 pending review by both a building code official and an ADA consultant. The motion was seconded by Mr. McCabe. The motion passed 6-to-0.

Reports

A. Administrative Approvals

Mr. Dellett said that there were six administrative approvals for this month:

1. COA-15-37 St. Paul AME Zion Church, 269 South Washington Street. Alteration. In-kind replacement of roof.
2. COA-15-38 Mark Nesbitt, 271 Baltimore Street. Alteration. Replace existing wooden fence with metal fence.
3. COA-15-40 Jennifer Phillips, 261 Baltimore Street. Alteration. In-kind replacement of standing seam roof.
4. COA-15-43 Shirley Sistrunk, 151-153 West High Street. Alteration. Replace part of chain-link fence with wooden fence.
5. COA-15-44 Kurt Kramer, 12 Wade Avenue. Alteration. In-kind replacement of shingle roof.
6. COA-15-45 David Petters, 2 Baltimore Street. Alteration. In-kind replacement of shingle roof.

Mr. Dellett noted that Mr. Petters' application was submitted after the deadline, but it was approved administratively. Mr. Shaffer asked what the color tone of the proposed shingles was, and Mr. Petters replied that it was a light gray.

B. Planning Director

Mr. Dellett said that there was no report.

Ms. Gustafson asked about the possibility of the Board discussing in-house historic topics for training following brief board meetings. Mr. Dellett said that the best time to

discuss those topics would be during the December through February months. He indicated that there will be training components through the CDLG grant.

Mr. Shaffer noted that there will be a future public meeting conducted by the Civil War Trust regarding their property on Buford Avenue. He noted that they have been doing a lot of political maneuvering regarding their intentions for that property. He said that Board members, as a semi-judicial review board, could not go to that meeting or any public meeting because anything said publically could prejudice the Board. PHMC reviewed our meeting minutes and are aware of what is going on here. He noted that there is a lot of support for HARB's position regarding the Buford property.

Other Business

Mr. Dellett said that Mr. Baldwin from Gettysburg College would like to ask the Board about the procedure for repairing the roof on Pennsylvania Hall. He said that the roof is at the end of its life, was originally coated in 1982, and that the cupola is made out of tin. He believed that the roof is a true rolled-seam roof. He said that the building is on the National Register for Historic Places and is located in the Historic District. The intent by the College is to replace the roof with a tin roof. He also noted that the handrail surrounding the cupola is in bad shape. He wanted to know what procedures needed to be followed to repair the roof on a building that is on the National Historic Register.

Mr. Shaffer said that the College would only have to deal with the HARB board regarding the repair of the roof. He said that if federal money is involved then there would be other implications. He did note that the actual review would come before this Board, and that the normal application process would have to be followed. He suggested that the College do their due diligence and give the Board something to review. Mr. Baldwin said that the College would do formal submissions, but the College would need to work it into their budget for the upcoming year.

With no other business before the Board, the Board adjourned the meeting at 8:10 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Karen M. Mesher
Borough Management Assistant