

February 18, 2015
Historic Architectural Review Board Minutes
Borough of Gettysburg

Gary Shaffer called the Historic Architectural Review Board meeting to order at 7:05 PM on Wednesday, February 18, 2015. The meeting was held at the Borough Municipal Building, 59 East High Street. A quorum was present. Those in attendance were: Board members Philip Goble, Peggy Gustafson, Joan Hodges, Colleen Lingle, Jim McCabe and Aubrey Burkholder, Borough Code Enforcement Officer; Scott Dellett, Borough Planning Director; and Karen Mesher, Borough Management Assistant. Also in attendance were: Bob Sharrah of Sharrah Design Group, Inc. (SDGI), representing 297 Steinwehr Avenue; Bob Holyman, representing 131 York Street; Zafar Iqbal, representing Gettysburg American Fuel at 243 Steinwehr Avenue; and Frank Stroik of the Country Homestead, Keane PA. Board Member Colleen Lingle was absent.

Reorganization

As usual during the first meeting of the year, the Board reorganized. Mr. Dellett opened the floor for nominations for chairman. Mr. Shaffer was nominated by Mr. Goble; Ms. Hodges seconded. There being no other nominations, Mr. Goble moved to close the nominations; seconded by Ms. Hodges. Mr. Shaffer assumed his role as Chair and received nominations for vice chairman. Ms. Gustafson nominated Phil Goble; Mr. McCabe seconded. . There being no other nominations, Mr. Goble moved to close the nominations; Ms. Gustafson seconded. Mr. Goble agreed to serve as vice chairman.

Review of Agenda and Minutes

There were no additions or corrections to the meeting agenda. Mr. Goble moved to approve the minutes of the December 17, 2014 meeting. Ms. Gustafson seconded the motion. The motion passed, 6 to 0.

Public Comment for Items Not on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items not on the meeting agenda.

New Applications for Application for Certificates of Appropriateness

Mr. Shaffer introduced the members and explained the procedures that would be followed during the meeting. He noted that the Board serves as an advisory group to Borough Council, which makes final decisions concerning the issuance of Certificates of Appropriateness. Borough Council will next meet on Monday, March 9, 2015.

A. COA-15-03 Zafar Iqbal/Gettysburg American Fuel, 243 Steinwehr Avenue. Alteration. Renovate exterior garage door of a convenience store/gas station into a window.

Mr. Shaffer presented the *Proposed Findings of Fact* as depicted in the Board Memorandum dated February 18, 2015:

- The building at 243 Steinwehr Avenue is a sensitive building, as defined in Chapter 11 of the Borough Code of Ordinances, Historic Districts (Historic District Ordinance). A sensitive building is defined as any building that has been standing for at least 50 years at the time of application, even though it has been considerably modified and certain sites of later historic significance or buildings that the Board has determined to be exemplary of later architectural styles.
- The building is a non-contributing structure to the Gettysburg Battlefield National Register Historic District.
- The proposed work constitute a permanent change, making this proposal a critical project, which is defined in the Historic District Ordinance as “a project involving demolition of all or part of any building or change in configuration and rhythm of any building as a whole, or any alteration to a sensitive building.”

Mr. Shaffer presented two additional findings:

- The building was altered; the garage bay doors were removed and a store front installed
- The building is not of historical merit

Mr. Iqbal gave a brief presentation. He said that the building is used for storage, and that he would like to tear down the wall that separates the garage from the convenience store. Ms. Hodges asked if he planned on replicating the window like the one next to it. Mr. Iqbal replied yes. Ms. Gustafson asked if the gas pumps would remain. Mr. Iqbal replied no, that it would be just a convenience store.

Ms. Gustafson made the **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed plans depicted in the proposed application dated February 2, 2015 to renovate the exterior garage door of a convenience store/ gas station into a window at 243 Steinwehr Avenue. The motion was seconded by Mr. McCabe. The motion carried 6-to-0.

B. COA-15-04 Jordan Kuharske, 131 York Street. Alteration. Replace existing door slabs.

Mr. Shaffer reminded the Board to keep in mind that the doors are significant and that they should be maintained.

Mr. Shaffer presented the *Proposed Findings of Fact* as stated in the Board Memorandum dated February 18, 2015:

- The building at 131 York Street is a sensitive building, as defined in Chapter 11 of the Borough Code of Ordinances, Historic Districts (Historic District Ordinance). A sensitive building is defined as any building that has been standing for at least 50 years at the time of application, even though it has been considerably modified and certain sites of later historic significance or buildings that the Board has determined to be exemplary of later architectural styles.
- The building is a contributing structure to the Gettysburg Battlefield National Register Historic District.
- The proposed work constitute a permanent change, making this proposal a critical project, which is defined in the Historic District Ordinance as “a project involving demolition of all or part of any building or change in configuration and rhythm of any building as a whole, or any alteration to a sensitive building.”

Mr. Shaffer also read the Building History from the February 18, 2015 Board Memorandum:

Known as the George W. Strickhouser residence, the 2-1/2-story brick dwelling house was built in 1857. According to the applicant, the existing two front doors are not original to the building.

GETTYSBURG DESIGN GUIDE

Below are the guidelines for doors in the *Gettysburg Design Guide*:

Doors are significant and should be retained if they:

- Are original;
- Reflect the original design intent for the building;
- Reflect period or regional styles or building practices;
- Reflect changes to the building from major events;
- Are examples of exceptional craftsmanship or design.

Below are the options for repairing, rehabilitating and replacing historic wood windows and doors:

- First Choice: Undertake routine maintenance on doors. This may include scraping, sanding, priming and repainting.
- Second Choice: Repair decayed parts in place.
- Third Choice: Without replacing the entire unit, replace parts of the door by patching, splicing, and piecing in using surviving parts as models, choose replacement parts that match the original in size, shape, material and all detailing. If a majority of a member is deteriorated, replace the entire member using the old one as a pattern for the new.
- Fourth Choice: If a majority of the component of the door or door frame requires replacement, consider replacing the entire unit.

Mr. Holyman said that it was his intention to swap out the door panels, that the door is rotten at the bottom, and that the door is not weather-tight. He said that the door failed the ice pick test. He would like to replace the two six-panel doors, and that the new doors would reflect the original design and period style. He said that he will not replace the entire door unit, but only replace the door slabs. The existing transom, linfel, and door jambs will remain intact.

Mr. Goble asked if the door jambs are solid. Mr. Holyman said that they appeared to be solid, and that they were attached to the brick. Mr. McCabe asked if the door color matched the color on the building. Mr. Holyman said that he will paint the doors to match the square. Ms. Gustafson asked if any dimensions will be padded. Mr. Holyman replied that he will trim the slabs to match the existing doors. Mr. Goble asked if the hardware is original, and if not, what will you be using. Mr. Holyman will try to replace the hardware. Mr. Goble said that both Home Depot and Lowes have period hardware that will replicate the period. Mr. Shaffer suggested using a knob set with a rectangular square panel or scroll handle.

Mr. Goble made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed plans depicted in the application dated February 2, 2015 to replace the existing doors at 131 York Street. The motion was seconded by Ms. Gustafson. The motion carried 6-to-0.

C. COA-15-06 Certificate of Appropriateness, Alteration, Future Stake, Inc., 297 Steinwehr Avenue

Mr. Shaffer gave *the Proposed Findings of Fact* as stated in the Board Memorandum dated February 13, 2015:

- The building at 297 Steinwehr Avenue is a sensitive building, as defined in Chapter 11 of the Borough Code of Ordinances, Historic Districts (Historic District Ordinance). A sensitive building is defined as any building that has been standing for at least 50 years at the time of application, even though it has been considerably modified and certain sites of later historic significance or buildings that the Board has determined to be exemplary of later architectural styles.
- The building is a non-contributing structure to the Gettysburg Battlefield National Register Historic District.
- The proposed work constitute a permanent change, making this proposal a critical project, which is defined in the Historic District Ordinance as “a project involving demolition of all or part of any building or change in configuration and rhythm of any building as a whole, or any alteration to a sensitive building.”
- The doors, according to the applicant, are believed to be the original doors when the building was constructed in 1962.

Mr. Sharrah said that he would like to replace the existing double front doors on the Gettysburg Heritage Center because the existing doors are not sufficient.

Mr. Shaffer stated that the pediment is not original and pointed out that the eagle will remain. Ms. Gustafson asked if the pediment will remain and if any changes would be considered to the shop windows in the little bays. Mr. Sharrah said that the pediment would remain and that he is only considering the doors. Mr. Goble asked if the side lights will be replaced by columns. Mr. Sharrah replied yes that the side lights would be replaced by columns. Ms. Hodges asked if the existing triangle. Mr. Sharrah clarified the drawing to the Board. Mr. Goble asked if the triangle would be replaced. Mr. Sharrah stated that the triangle stays.

Mr. Goble made the **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed plans depicted in the application dated February 3, 2015 to replace the existing double front doors with mahogany doors at 297 Steinwehr Avenue. The motion was seconded by Mr. McCabe. The motion carried 6-to-0.

New Business

Mr. Dellett discussed the 2015 Historic Preservation Awards. He said staff prepared an excel spreadsheet of all of the submitted applications, and it will be available at the March meeting for Board review in advance of the award presentation at May’s Council meeting. He would like to submit applicants to Council in April for their official presentation of award recipients in May. He asked the Board to review the list, and asked the Board to submit any properties in the

Historic District with completed work. Mr. Dellett said that those properties with unfinished work would be considered in 2016.

Mr. Dellett said that there is no update on the CLBG Grant. Mr. Dellett said that he was approached by Preservation PA to continue the grant. He stated that they were notified of the grant in January, but the deadline for grant submission was January 15th. He noted that this program was well-received by the Board for educating members and meeting training requirements.

Reports

Mr. Dellett described the Administrative Approvals:

- COA-15-01 Paul Kellett, 48 Breckenridge Street. In-kind replacement of roof damaged by fire
- COA-15-02 Trinity United Church of Christ, 60 East High Street. In-kind replacement of porch.
- COQ-15-05 Mark and Heidi Kile, 323 Baltimore Street. Repair and repaint existing windows.

Mr. Dellett stated that there was nothing else to report. He noted that he will continue to put any administrative approvals on the agenda to inform the Board, and that this will be a monthly occurrence.

Mr. Shaffer stated that the *Proposed Findings of Fact* have to be read out at the public meetings for a matter of record. He also said that he would be more careful not to frame the motions, and that the Board will have to do that. He said that he will provide any appropriate explanations if needed. Mr. Dellett said that the memorandums do have a proposed motion.

Other Business

Mr. Stroik asked if there was any information on the wood shed located at 323 Baltimore Street. He said that General Schimmelpfennig hid there, and that the shed was detached from the house. Mr. Shaffer said that Anna Garlach had left the house and came to see him. He noted that there was a small drainage swell that goes across Baltimore Street. He would have to look into the shed's location further.

With no other business before the Board, the Board adjourned the meeting at 7:50 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Karen M. Mesher
Borough Management Assistant