

March 16, 2016
Historic Architectural Review Board Minutes
Borough of Gettysburg

Chair Gary Shaffer called the Historic Architectural Review Board meeting to order at 7:00 PM on Wednesday, March 16, 2016. The meeting was held at the Borough Municipal Building, 59 East High Street. A quorum was present. Those in attendance were: Board members Peggy Gustafson, Joan Hodges, Jim McCabe, Phil Goble, Colleen Lingle and Clem Malot, Borough Code Enforcement Officer; Scott Dellett, Borough Planning Director and Karen Mesher, Borough Management Assistant. Also in attendance were: Steve Wyngarden, Becky Zeller of LSC Design, Josh Austin of Mark Austin Building and Remodeling, Inc., Adam Gillenwater, and Matthew George, all representing the Civil War Trust, 401 Buford Avenue; Jair Barr of JGQ Properties representing 105 East Middle Street; Paul Witt and Nate Mares, representing the Best Western Hotel, 301 Steinwehr Avenue; Jim Paddock of 1777 Fairfield Road; and Jim Hale of the *Gettysburg Times*.

Review of Agenda and Minutes

There were no additions or corrections to the meeting agenda. Mr. Goble made the **motion** to approve the minutes of the February 17, 2016 meeting. Seconded by Ms. Lingle. Motion carried 7-to-0.

Public Comment for Items Not on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items not on the meeting agenda. Mr. Paddock was here to observe tonight's meeting.

New Applications for Application for Certificates of Appropriateness

Mr. Shaffer introduced the members and explained the procedures that would be followed during the meeting. He noted that the Board serves as an advisory group to Borough Council, which makes the final decision concerning the issuance of Certificates of Appropriateness. Borough Council will next meet on Monday, April 11, 2016.

- A. COA-16-08 Civil War Trust, 401 Buford Avenue, Certificate of Appropriateness, Alteration.** The applicant proposed the following projects for the Mary Thompson House: Repoint exterior masonry walls and elevations, construct a porch at the east elevation, repair and replace windows, replace existing door with a window at the north elevation, reconstruct a wood rose trellis, remove the dormers and replace the roof, and replace the doors on the east, south and north elevations.

Mr. Dellett gave background information and a brief building history from the Board Memorandum dated March 10, 2016:

BUILDING HISTORY

Information on the Mary Thompson House is provided with the attached Gettysburg Historic Building Survey Committee Survey Form (GETTS/HBSC 141-88) prepared in 1988.

In early 1995, Belmar Partnership bought the complex, including the hotel, restaurant, and Civil War museum and gift shop. The Civil War Trust acquired the property on January 7, 2015.

PREVIOUS APPROVAL

At its December 14, 2015 meeting Council approved the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish buildings formerly known as the Larson's Quality Inn motel and Appalachian Brewing Co. restaurant. The two stone structures on the property – the Mary Thompson House and the Dustman Barn – remain.

Mr. Wyngarden made a brief presentation and answered questions from the Board. Mr. Wyngarden said that the Mary Thompson House would be restored in several steps including: constructing the porch, replacing the windows that were vandalized, restoring a second floor door to a window with original stone fill-in, restoring the stairs, restoring the doors with custom-made doors, removing the dormers, replacing the roof, and adding a rose trellis as depicted in the Matthew Brady 1863 photos. Mr. Austin said that cedar shingles would be used for the roof and that the windows would be six-over-six wooden windows. Mr. Wyngarden said that the paint would be removed from the stone to reflect its original appearance.

Mr. Shaffer presented the *Proposed Findings of Fact*:

- The Mary Thompson House at 401 Buford Avenue is a sensitive structure, as defined in Chapter 11 of the Borough Code of Ordinances, Historic Districts (Historic District Ordinance). A sensitive building is defined as any building that has been standing for at least 50 years at the time of application, even though it has been considerably modified and certain sites of later historic significance or buildings that the Board has determined to be exemplary of later architectural styles.
- The building is a contributing structure to the Gettysburg Battlefield National Register Historic District.
- The proposed work constitute a permanent change, making this proposal a critical project, which is defined in the Historic District Ordinance as "A project involving demolition of all or part of any building or change in configuration

and rhythm of any building as a whole, or any alteration to a sensitive building.”

Mr. Shaffer noted that this building has a high degree of significance in relation to the Battle of Gettysburg and to General Robert E. Lee.

Mr. Goble made the **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed plans By the Civil War Trust for 401 Buford Avenue depicted in the proposed application dated February 24, 2016 as presented with the following stipulation to leave any windows in place that are not in disrepair. The motion was seconded by Ms. Lingle. The motion carried 7-to-0.

Mr. Shaffer recused himself as Chair due to a fiduciary relationship with the following three applicants, whereby Mr. Goble assumed the role as Chair.

- B. COA-16-10 JGQ Properties, 105 East Middle Street. Alteration. Remove the rear first-floor covered porch; construct a two-story wooden deck to extend up to the third floor to permit a rear entrance to all three floors.**

Mr. Dellett gave background information from the Board memorandum dated March 10, 2016:

BUILDING HISTORY

.....
The Italianate style came into the Borough just before the Civil War, the turning point in Gettysburg’s history. Not only did the Battle of Gettysburg make the community known to the world, it altered the local economy. Though the town continued its manufacturing, especially furniture, tourism provided its greatest source of economic expansion. The Borough had a growing middle class and increased wealth. Larger homes, churches and commercial buildings emerged and several new neighborhoods developed. Italianate had a flexibility that continued to serve the Borough’s changing fortunes.

The house at 105 East Middle Street demonstrates a variation of the Italianate style popularly known as the French Second Empire style, which was embraced throughout the United States. These buildings had Italianate features plus a mansard roof, which provided an additional story under a steeply sloped roof, thereby diminishing visually the massiveness of the building.

According to the Gettysburg Design Guide, 105 East Middle Street was built in 1870. William D. “Billy” Armor lived in the residence for 45 years. Mr. Armor was one of the Borough’s pioneer business men and a leading plumber in Gettysburg for more than a half century, according to an April 8, 1940 article in *The Gettysburg Times*.

Mr. Barr and Mr. Shaffer gave a brief presentation and responded to Board questions. Mr. Shaffer said that a hand rail will end at the final grade level, and will be an outside value series traditional rail system with simple profiles and without turning point balusters. He said that the railings will meet all building code required by commercial buildings. Mr. Barr said that the use of the property is undetermined. He said that the second egress requires an exit, and that the storage shed will be removed. Mr. Shaffer said that the width of the deck is slightly larger than the rear porch roof, providing for seating and passage.

Mr. Goble presented the *Proposed Findings of Fact*:

- The structure at 105 East Middle Street is a sensitive structure, as defined in Chapter 11 of the Borough Code of Ordinances, Historic Districts (Historic District Ordinance). A sensitive building is defined as any building that has been standing for at least 50 years at the time of application, even though it has been considerably modified and certain sites of later historic significance or buildings that the Board has determined to be exemplary of later architectural styles.
- The outbuilding is a contributing structure to the Gettysburg Battlefield National Register Historic District.
- The proposed work constitute a permanent change, making this proposal a critical project, which is defined in the Historic District Ordinance as "A project involving demolition of all or part of any building or change in configuration and rhythm of any building as a whole, or any alteration to a sensitive building."

Ms. Gustafson made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for 105 East Middle Street for the proposed plans depicted in the application dated March 1, 2016 to remove the rear first floor covered porch and construct a two-story wooden deck to extend up to the third floor to allow for the rear entrance for all three floors of the building. The motion was seconded by Mr. McCabe. The motion carried 6-to-0 with one abstention.

- D. COA-16-12 Paul Witt, 301 Steinwehr Avenue. New Construction. Construct a new three-story, 15,500-square foot Best Western Hotel on the front portion of the property.**

Mr. Dellett gave background information from the Board memorandum dated March 10, 2016:

BUILDING HISTORY

Capitalizing on the American History tourist trade, the Gettysburg Howard Johnson's Motor Inn opened in 1960 adjacent to the National Civil War Museum. The owner acquired the hotel in 1975 and operated it as a Howard Johnson's until 1999. The hotel was branded as an America's Best Value Inn in 2006.

PREVIOUS APPROVAL

At its December 14, 2015 meeting, Council approved a Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish the existing "America's Best Value Inn and Suites" Building.

Mr. Shaffer gave a brief presentation and responded to Board questions. Mr. Shaffer said that the revisions from the initial design submission include: the finalized stone and masonry colors and style, the shorter building height, the finalized elevations, and the addition of the solar shading on the south-facing windows. He said that there will probably be four signs that will face four different streets and will be submitted at a later date. He noted the revisions to the porte cochere fascia detailing. He explained the use/installation of the thin brick and stucco that will be used on the building. He said that the demolition of the existing building in the next few weeks.

Mr. Goble presented the *Proposed Findings of Fact*:

- The proposed construction constitutes a permanent change, making this proposal a critical project, which is defined in the Historic District Ordinance as "a project involving demolition of all or part of any building or change in configuration and rhythm of any building as a whole, or any alteration to a sensitive building."
- According to Section 11-110.1.F of the Borough Code of Ordinances, Historic Districts, "contemporary design of new buildings shall be encouraged, provided the design is compatible for existing neighboring structures in scale, size, color, building materials and other consideration listed in (Section 11-110.1.C) of this Section."

Ms. Lingle made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for 301 Steinwehr Avenue for the proposed plans depicted in the application dated March 2, 2016 as submitted. The motion was seconded by Mr. Malot. The motion carried 6-to-0 with one abstention.

- C. COA-16-11 M.G. Felty, Inc., 777 Baltimore Street. Alteration. Construct a small roof over the ramp door to match the style of the rest of the previously approved façade change.

Mr. Dellett gave background information from the Board memorandum dated March 10, 2016:

BUILDING HISTORY

As part of local businesses' efforts to capitalize on the Battle of Gettysburg's Centennial in the early and mid-1960s, the main roads surrounding the battlefield – including Baltimore Street and Steinwehr Avenue – saw commercial development. LeRoy Smith, who acquired the Orphanage Building in 1965, served as the catalyst of the marketing effort. He opened Old Gettysburg Village, a period shopping mall, in the mid-1960s.

PREVIOUS APPROVAL

At its October 13, 2015 meeting, Council approved the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness for a façade renovation to the existing Fudge Shack Suite at the Old Gettysburg Village, including a demolition the false façade on the northern part of the property, accessible ramp on the north side of the building, addition of a new entrance door. The front of the building will receive new windows and entry door, decorative paneling, a new entry step, a parapet wall and new siding.

Mr. Shaffer gave a brief presentation and responded to Board questions. He said that the addition of the small roof over the ramp door was reconfigured to protect the door and to add focus of interest as a new feature. Mr. Shaffer said that the all of the utilities will be rerouted and metered differently.

Mr. Goble presented the *Proposed Findings of Fact*:

- The structure at 777 Baltimore Street is a sensitive building, as defined in Chapter 11 of the Borough Code of Ordinances, Historic Districts (Historic District Ordinance). A sensitive building is defined as a building that has been standing for at least 50 years at the time of application, even though it has been considerably modified and certain sites of later historic significance or buildings that the Board has determined to be exemplary of later architectural styles.
- The proposed work is a permanent change, making this proposal a critical project, which is defined in the Historic Districts Ordinance as "A project involving demolition of all or part of any building or change in configuration and rhythm of any building as a whole, or any alteration to a sensitive building."

- The building is a contributing structure to the Gettysburg Battlefield National Register Historic District.

Mr. Malot made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for 777 Baltimore Street for the proposed plans depicted in the application dated March 2, 2016 as submitted. The motion was seconded by Ms. Lingle. The motion carried 6-to-0 with one abstention.

Mr. Shaffer resumed his role as Chair.

Reports

- A. Mr. Dellett presented the Administrative Approvals since the last meeting:
 1. **COA-16-09 The Memorial Church of the Prince of Peace, 20 West High Street. Alteration. Replace roofing materials at the cricket area between the church and the parish offices with in-kind materials.**
 2. **COA-16-13 Jon Weikert, 143 Chambersburg Street. Alteration. In-kind replacement and repair of damage to the building using bricks of similar color, size and texture; and the mortar used is not Portland and as mixed as near as possible to the existing color.**
- B. Mr. Dellett discussed the Training and Continuing Education Scholarships provided by the Pennsylvania State Historic Preservation Office Certified Local Government (CLG) Program. He said that applications are due April 1st.

Other Business

- A. Mr. Dellett said that Ms. Crawford is putting together a HARB training on windows as part of the Centralized Local Government (CLG) grant. Ms. Gustafson noted the Preservation Workshops advertised in the *Gettysburg Times* by Stephen Brown from March through September and wondered if they would meet the criteria for continuing education credits. Mr. Dellett said that the Board should focus on in-house training for HARB members, and to address the window survey form. He said that he would contact Mindy Crawford from Preservation Pennsylvania to set-up dates.
- B. Mr. Dellett discussed the 2016 Historic Preservation Awards. He said that the Board reviewed eight nominees and selected their recipients for their submission to Council in April. The official presentation of award recipients will be at the May council meeting.
- C. The Board discussed the window survey form.
- D. Mr. Shaffer discussed the proposed satellite dishes and their regulation in the Historic District. He said that their proliferation in the Historic District is creating a negative