

**January 20, 2016**  
**Historic Architectural Review Board Minutes**  
**Borough of Gettysburg**

Planning Director Scott Dellett called the Historic Architectural Review Board meeting to order at 7:00 PM on Wednesday, January 20, 2016. The meeting was held at the Borough Municipal Building, 59 East High Street. A quorum was present. Those in attendance were: Board members Gary Shaffer, Philip Goble, Peggy Gustafson, Joan Hodges, Jim McCabe and Clem Malot, Borough Building Code Official; and Karen Mesher, Borough Management Assistant. Also in attendance were: Jim Biesecker and William E. Baldwin, both of Gettysburg College, representing Pennsylvania Hall on Penn Hall Drive; Chuck Moran of Gettysburg Hotel, representing One Lincoln Square; Stuart Christenson and Mark Weaver, both of Noelker & Hull, Inc., both representing Pennsylvania Hall and the Gettysburg Hotel; and Mindy Crawford of Preservation Pennsylvania. Board Member Colleen Lingle was absent.

**Reorganization**

As usual during the first meeting of the year, the Board reorganized. Mr. Dellett opened the floor for nominations for chairman. Mr. Shaffer was nominated by Mr. Goble; Ms. Hodges seconded. There being no other nominations, Mr. Goble moved to close the nominations; seconded by Mr. Malot. Mr. Shaffer assumed his role as Chair. He asked for nominations for vice chairman. Ms. Gustafson nominated Phil Goble; Mr. McCabe seconded. There being no other nominations, Ms. Gustafson moved to close the nominations; Ms. Hodges seconded. Mr. Goble agreed to serve as vice chairman. Mr. Shaffer asked for a motion to set the meeting date for the third Wednesday of every month pending holidays and major weather events. Mr. Shaffer called for a vote, and the motion carried 6-to-0.

**Review of Agenda and Minutes**

There were no additions or corrections to the meeting agenda. Mr. Goble made the **motion** to approve the meeting agenda as presented. Ms. Hodges seconded. The motion carried 6-to-0. Mr. Goble made the **motion** to approve the minutes of the November 12, 2015 meeting. Ms. Hodges seconded the motion. Motion carried 6-to-0. Mr. Goble made the **motion** to approve the minutes of the November 18, 2015 meeting, pending the following questions answered regarding concerns raised on pages 3 (last paragraph) and page 5 (second to the last paragraph). Mr. McCabe seconded the motion. The motion passed, 6 to 0. The questions will be discussed at the end of the meeting under *Other Business*.

**Public Comment for Items Not on the Agenda**

There were no public comments for items not on the meeting agenda.

## **New Applications for Application for Certificates of Appropriateness**

Mr. Shaffer introduced the members and explained the procedures that would be followed during the meeting. He noted that the Board serves as an advisory group to Borough Council, which makes final decisions concerning the issuance of Certificates of Appropriateness. Borough Council will next meet on Monday, February 8, 2016.

### **A. COA-16-01 Gettysburg College/Pennsylvania Hall, Penn Hall Drive, Certificate of Appropriateness, Alteration.**

Mr. Dellett gave background information and a brief building history from his Board Memorandum dated January 13, 2016:

The applicant requests Certificate of Appropriateness approval to make the following modifications to Pennsylvania Hall:

- Remove the sheet metal and metal panels and restore the wood cornice and soffit, replace the various metal and wood element in kind with C&Btr Douglas Fir, painting them to match the existing white;
- Replace the building roof with new Englert wide standing seam metal panels with a "patina" green finish;
- Line the built-in gutters with copper panels with soldered seams; and
- Replace the cupola flat roof with copper panels with soldered seams.

According to the applicant, the modifications will re-establish some of the building's historic character lost when the wooden cornices were covered and will improve the building's weather tightness while returning the roof to a more traditional appearance.

### **BUILDING HISTORY**

As presented in the application materials, Pennsylvania Hall is the oldest building at Gettysburg College. In the 1830s, the college bought six acres of land northwest of the Borough square from Thaddeus Stevens and constructed Pennsylvania Hall at the site in 1837. The building was the first academic building on campus. Designed in the Greek Revival style, the building is four stories tall, fronted by a full-height portico with four fluted Doric columns and topped by a 24-foot-high octagonal cupola.

The building was used as a lookout post and field hospital during the Battle of Gettysburg. Convalescing soldiers from both sides remained there for months after the battle. After the war, Penn Hall's function change to a dormitory; the building became known as "Old Dorm". Various renovations over the years culminated in a major structural renovation in 1969. Penn Hall was added to the U.S. National Register of

Historic Places in 1972 and today houses the college's administrative offices, including the offices of the college president and provost.

During a renovation project, the current red standing seam roof was installed, some of the wooden cornice elements were wrapped in sheet metal and the cornice soffit was replaced with metal soffit panels.

Mr. Shaffer and Mr. Baldwin made a brief presentation and answered questions from the Board. Mr. Baldwin described the roof renovation, noting the use of one piece of flat seam copper to allow photographers to take pictures. He noted that the green patina would match the color on other buildings, and that the original roof was believed to be metal. Mr. Shaffer noted that if the original roof material was removed/replaced, then the Board cannot force the applicant to return the materials to the original materials. He said that the color was reviewed because it is a permanent color change.

Mr. Shaffer presented the *Proposed Findings of Fact*:

- Pennsylvania Hall, located at Penn Hall Drive, is a sensitive structure, as defined in Chapter 11 of the Borough Code of Ordinances, Historic Districts (Historic District Ordinance). A sensitive building is defined as any building that has been standing for at least 50 years at the time of application, even though it has been considerably modified and certain sites of later historic significance or buildings that the Board has determined to be exemplary of later architectural styles.
- The building is a contributing structure to the Gettysburg Battlefield National Register Historic District.
- Pennsylvania Hall was added to the National Register of Historic Places in 1972.
- The proposed work constitute a permanent change, making this proposal a critical project, which is defined in the Historic District Ordinance as "A project involving demolition of all or part of any building or change in configuration and rhythm of any building as a whole, or any alteration to a sensitive building."

Mr. Goble made the **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed plans depicted in the proposed application dated December 3, 2015 as presented. The motion was seconded by Ms. Gustafson. The motion carried 6-to-0.

**B. COA-16-02 Gettysburg Hotel Investors L.P., 1 Lincoln Square, Certificate of Appropriateness. Alteration.**

Mr. Dellett gave background information from his Board memorandum dated January 13, 2016:

**DESCRIPTION**

The applicant requests Certificate of Appropriateness approval to replace four existing wood double-hung windows on four rooms/suites in the front of the hotel with aluminum-clad wood double hung windows.

**BUILDING HISTORY**

The Gettysburg Hotel started as a tavern, Scott's Tavern, which was built in 1797 by James Scott and acquired by William McClellan in 1809. McClellan renamed the tavern the Indian Queen and after 1846, it was called the McClellan House. The site was revamped in the 1890s and christened the Gettysburg Hotel, which operated until its closing in 1964. The building had 19 apartments and seven specialty shops when a fire destroyed the building on February 11, 1983. Through an initiative of Gettysburg College, the hotel was rebuilt and opened on May 15, 1991.

Stuart Christenson, architect for the applicant, gave a brief presentation and answered questions from the Board. He said that the Hotel is located on a busy intersection and that traffic noise and leaking windows lead to their decision to seek their replacement. The Hotel is interested in testing two window types on four rooms, and they would be white in color, made of insulated glaze to get the best acoustical isolation for their patrons. He said that the awnings would remain. He noted that the profile of the proposed window is very similar to what is there now.

Mr. Shaffer presented the *Proposed Findings of Fact*:

- The building at 1 Lincoln Square is a non-sensitive building, a building in the Historic District that has been standing for less than 50 years at the time of application. Although it is a non-sensitive structure, the building is architectural significant because of its prominence on Lincoln Square. The building replicated certain details of the hotel building standing at the time of the fire.
- The building is a non-contributing structure to the Gettysburg Battlefield National Register Historic District.
- The proposed work constitute a permanent change, making this proposal a critical project, which is defined in the Historic District Ordinance as "A project

involving demolition of all or part of any building or change in configuration and rhythm of any building as a whole, or any alteration to a sensitive building.”

Mr. Goble made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed plans depicted in the application dated December 23, 2015 to replace the existing windows with test windows, but would submit a copy of the test data when the final application is made. The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges. The motion carried 6-to-0.

### **New Business**

Mr. Dellett discussed the 2015 Historic Preservation Awards. He said staff prepared an Excel spreadsheet of all of the submitted applications, and it will be available at the March meeting for Board review in advance of the award presentation at May’s Council meeting. He would like to submit applicants to Council in April for their official presentation of award recipients in May. He asked the Board to review the list, and asked the Board to submit any properties in the Historic District with completed work. Mr. Dellett said that those properties with unfinished work would be considered in 2016.

### **Reports**

Mr. Dellett described the Administrative Approvals (see agenda), and stated two of them were scheduled to appear before the Board in December, but were administratively approved so as to not delay the applicant. The third applicant was the demolition of a non-salvageable garage.

Mr. Dellett stated that there was nothing else to report. He noted that he will continue to put any administrative approvals on the agenda to inform the Board, and that this will be a monthly occurrence.

### **Other Business**

- Mr. Dellett discussed the 2016 Historic Preservation Awards. He said staff prepared an excel spreadsheet of all of the submitted applications, and it will be available at the March meeting for Board review in advance of the award presentation at May’s Council meeting. He would like to submit applicants to Council in April for their official presentation of award recipients in May. He asked the Board to review the list, and asked the Board to submit any properties in the Historic District with completed work. Mr. Dellett said that those properties with unfinished work would be considered in 2016. He responded to a Board request to “trim down” the list, eliminating applicants that would not qualify. He would also amend the data base to alphabetize by street. He asked the Board to recommend any applicants that should be removed.

- Mindy Crawford discussed the status of the 2016 Centralized Local Government Grant. She talked about the Preservation 50 initiative and how it relates to preservation by local governments. She said the purpose of the grant this year is to provide trainings to HARBs that are involved in the pilot program. She had asked the Board to consider topics they would like to discuss: real estate guidelines for first-time home buyers in Historic Districts, public relations to promote HARB, to name a few.

Mr. Dellett discussed the window survey form. Mr. Shaffer said that this very specific form would help home owners identify problem areas for their windows and assess the damage. He said that the Board needs to develop and edit a workable form that would provide the most information to the board regarding windows. Ms. Crawford noted that this form would meet the Secretary of the Interior Guidelines for a tax credit for homeowners. She explained that the form vets out the percentage of windows that need replaced.

Mr. Baldwin suggested providing a web-based search engine for local resources specializing in approved replacement windows that meet guideline standards.

- Mr. Shaffer discussed the submitted letter information regarding satellite dishes and their regulation in the Historic District, and what information is needed to inventory the process.
- Mr. Shaffer discussed the action taken regarding the November 18, 2016 meeting minutes: Mr. Ashraf was sent a copy of the motion with his denial letter (page 3); and the applicant did not come in for an application (page 5).
- Mr. Dellett said that a letter was received from Patrick Jennings regarding the Dusman Barn. Ms. Crawford said that the applicant intends to demolish the top of the barn, they must return for permission since the Board already approved their application with the top part intact.

With no other business before the Board, the Board adjourned the meeting at 9:18 PM.

Respectfully submitted,



Karen M. Mesher  
Borough Management Assistant